

INTERTEXTUALITY IN TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY DYSTOPIAN FICTIONS: THE HUNGER GAMES AND THE SELECTION

Sudianto

*English Study Program, Faculty of Social and Cultural Sciences
University of Trunojoyo Madura*

Abstract

*Kajian ini membahas hubungan intertekstualitas karya fiksi kontemporer *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection*. Dengan menentukan dominan aspek atau elemen berupa kesamaan dan perbedaan yang ada, pembaca akan mampu melihat hubungan satu dan yang lain. Sumber data berupa ucapan pemain dan penjelasan dari narator. Melalui pendekatan kualitatif, membaca, labeling, dan penyesuaian, data kemudian diseleksi. Analisa data menerapkan teknik K. Yin: menyusun, mengelola, menginterpretasikan, dan menyimpulkan. Hasil dari kajian ini mengemukakan bahwa Suzanne Collins' *The Hunger Games* telah menginspirasi Kiera Cass' *The Selection*. Terdapat 6 hubungan intertekstualitas yang potensial sebagai bentuk transformasi tekstual.*

Kata Kunci: intertextuality, dystopian fictions, hypogram, transformation, intertextual relations

INTRODUCTION

First and foremost, no poet, no artist of any of arts, has his complete meaning alone (Eliot, 1998). This implies that any of arts in this world never stand alone. It definitely influences the development of other creations. Plenty of works are created before other new works start to begin. Take the creation in fashion industrial for instance, fashion of the Northern Renaissance, which spans from 1500-1600, had three major influences (Caruso, 2016). As Tanya states:

Dior's collection [as one of them] was highly influenced by men and women's medieval attire, and attains similarity to illustrations from French manuscripts. (Caruso, 2016)

Among numbers of young adult (YA) novels inspired from re-written of Suzanne Collins' *The Hunger Games* (2008), one of them is *The Selection* (2012) by Kiera Cass. Collins has fiercely empowered Cass in writing her remarkable work. In *The Selection*, Cass does not only write back to Collins but also aims at challenging the tradition of 'selecting one' to win fame and fortune. There are several similarities and differences in constructing the dominant elements that form the novel together. This is another possible reason to follow why the writer selects these works to be analyzed.

Further, by understanding intertextuality as it was first emerged from Kristeva's early work. According to Allen (2000), the term intertextuality first entered into the French language in Julia Kristeva's early work of the middle to late 1960s. Kristeva was influenced by not only Bakhtinian but also Saussurean. To bear on this, the word *intertextuality* was coined by Kristeva on her article to introducing the work of

Bakhtinan in France (Still & Worton, 1990). The combination of the two theories emerge the notion of intertextuality. Text is constructed as a mosaic of quotations; any text is the absorption and transformation to other texts (Kristeva, 1986). It means the text that has already existed in the previous time. As she formulated as follows:

[...] process of creating a text outside the already present discourse. The authors are not original and compiled and do not create anything from their texts from original minds but compile from the already existing texts. (Allen, 2000, p. 35)

In intertextuality, core of a text namely hypogram and the following texts after the hypogram is so-called transformation. The transformation indeed is predicted as reaction, absorption and transformation. The best way to discover hypogram is concerning on time of publishing and how much similarities could be. Besides, that is the first step to do to look at the works which potentially either similar to others or even seem to re-writing or write-back-to.

Further, the act of re-writing a text or transformation is a process which has taken the form of a second hand-writing to renew the previous ones and to fit them with new social conditions of today. It implies that similar works is formulated to produce new form of a work. In other words, the work has power relation to one another. It more to be like innovatively re-writing a new form text combined with what is happening today in our environment.

Lastly, the writer is interested in analyzing both novels because they possess female as figure of protagonist. At this point, author is the centerpiece of all. To be more focus on the analysis, there are objectives this research focuses on: to discover similarities and differences in Suzanne Collin's *The Hunger Games* and Kiera Cass' *The Selection* and to consider intertextual relation which are depicted in *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection*.

METHODOLOGY

As it associates the title, in order to satisfy the objectives of this thesis, qualitative research was held. Qualitative research is an activity of situation that locates the observer in their world (Denzin & Lincoln, 2003). Regarding this explanation, the observer was being the one who responsible to transform the world by their own interpretation. The data were taken from the utterances and narrator's description which involved in the two novels being compared. Besides, the writer had two sources of data: primary and secondary. YA novels *The Hunger Games* (2008) by Suzanne Collin and *The Selection* (2012) by Kiera Cass were the primary sources of data in this study. Then the secondary data were taken from library, journals and internet. There were three steps of collecting data in this study, as they are: reading, labeling, and matching. After collecting the data, the very last technique in this study was technique of analyzing data. There were five steps prevailed in analyzing the data such as: compiling, disassembling, reassembling, interpreting and concluding (Yin, 2011).

DISCUSSION

In fact, both novels are truly giving the most similar exposure to their characters formula in constructing the story. Every story in the novel always has major character as one who obligates to dismantle the problems occurred. Collins paints Katniss

Everdeen and Peeta Mellark as the major character mostly. However, even he is not always happening to be in every case of the novel, Gale Hawthorne is part of the major characters as well. He is vocal in the story. Therefore, the formula of relating characters to each other can be seen as: Katniss, Peeta and Gale.

A. Protagonists

Every story has its own hero or anti-hero. The hero is called due to his or her courage either to solve the problem or to rescue somebody from something dangerous in story. The hero in literary works is frequently so-called as protagonist. Mostly, the protagonist is the most motivated and brave character in the story.

Fortunately, *The Hunger Games* possibly seems to inspire *The Selection* to have the same sort of protagonist. It is quite similar because both novels happen to possess female character to be the heroine in the story. Both characters also painted in quite similar personality. Katniss and America are the protagonist to their own story.

In *The Hunger Games*, Collins incredibly paints Katniss Everdeen as protagonist in brilliant way, the girl who embraces feminism and equality. The situation proved as follows.

I reach her just as she is about to mount the steps. With one sweep of my arm, I push her behind me.

“I volunteer!” I gasp. “I volunteer as tribute!” (Collins, 2008, p. 22)

B. Themes

People everywhere must survive to stay alive. They have to get job to make money. They have to make money to be able to eat so they are able to stay alive. It is not about how much effort to get through something. It is survival that matters. *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection* possess similar theme to be emerged. There are two possible themes to be assigned, survival and the power of dominant.

The prevalent theme to *The Hunger Games* is survival. Indeed, Katniss needs to survive the Games. However, she also must survive the daily life in district 12 before she finally becomes the volunteered tribute.

But the money ran out and we were slowly starving to death. There’s no other way to put it. I kept telling myself if I could only hold out until May, just May 8th, I would turn twelve and be able to sign up for the tesserae and get that precious grain and oil to feed us. Only there were still several weeks to go. We could well be dead by then. (Collins, 2008, p. 28)

Paradoxically, Katniss must be working so hard to keep her family away from starvation. It means that ‘starving to death’ is the only problem she has to deal with in her district. District 12, in which she lives for, is the poorest district in country of Panem. The district does not grow foods such as vegetables and fruits. The land is rich only with coals. By joining the Hunger Games, they wish to be showered by prizes and food for family.

C. In the Competition, the Main Character is Made to Meet Several Characters

In every story, the major characters could not be able to resolve the problem if they happen to barely meet everyone else during the journey. They are minor characters who support the plot of the story to be told in good way. In *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection*, it is found that both novels seem to have similar minor characters formula.

To survive the Games, there are people responsible to give the tributes lecturer (advice) during the Games. Katniss and Peeta will have two mentors to guide them to win the Games. They are Haymitch and Effie Trinket, the people who responsible with District 12 tributes.

“Yes,” hisses Effie Trinket. “How odd you two find it amusing. You know your mentor is your lifeline to the world in these Games. The one who advises you, lines up your sponsors, and dictates the presentation of any gifts. (Collins, 2008, p. 46)

As it is perceived in both novels, it is completely quite similar minor characters formula which is made to meet the protagonist. This element indeed proves that both novels are potentially having intertextual relation. In other words, *The Hunger Games* seems to inspire *The Selection* in creating new formation in sort of story.

D. Setting of Place

Story would be great if the setting is set to give certain effects to the characters and mood. Setting is considered as environment in which the story takes place. The setting is unlimited to place. Social condition is also considerable. The function definitely emerges the immense effects of story, specifically on characters and plot. In both novels, the setting of place has something in common.

In *The Hunger Games*, Collins creates two essential places to take place. They are Panem country and Capitol city. Both places are quite different in term of prosperity. Country of Panem is surrounding Capitol in which Katniss living with her family and colleagues. In different atmosphere, Capitol city is somewhere rich where the dominant are living their lives and the only which can conduct the Hunger Games.

In *The Selection*, there are two places known in the novel. They are Illéa and state of Carolina—America’s home. Kingdom of Illéa has been established as the place to heir throne from time to time. The constitution is absolutely monarchy. Besides, Illéa is located nearly in the continent of North America. The palace is known as the richest place in the territory. Nonetheless, the palace is definitely described in sophistication in the novels. The palace will be an arena where participants of the Selection would be competing to each other to win Prince Maxon’s heart and to be the Princess of Illéa.

E. Setting of Social

Setting is an essential element in which the story takes place, including time, place and social condition. In *The Hunger Games*, the social condition is centered to socio-economical aspect. For instance, class division does prevail even class struggle could be said so. Regarding to such situation, people who are wealthy enough is considered as the richest of them all. Then, people who are needed considered to be the one who are dying of starvation because they are poorest. The depiction is able to prove such circumstance as below.

Our part of District 12, nicknamed the Seam, is usually crawling with coal miners heading out to the morning shift at this hour. Men and women with hunched shoulders, swollen knuckles, many who have long since stopped trying to scrub the coal dust out of their broken nails, the lines of their sunken faces. (Collins, 2008, p. 4)

Further, *The Selection* has quite similar social setting in the story. When Collins paints class division in the form of districts, Cass repaints the class division in the form

of caste system to determine in which condition someone's economy belongs to. The caste, which is uncovered in the novel, started from One to Eight. One considers royalty and Eight considers gentry. The caste system indeed determines of which works they could afford to do. For instance, Three or Four could be the one who works for industry and office, and Six deserves to be maid who clean up people's house. The following prove that the upper caste may deal with prosper job to make money in their life.

A Four. She'd spent her formative years working in a factory or a shop, or maybe on a farm. I wondered about her life. Did she have a large family? She probably hadn't had to worry about food growing up. Were her friends jealous of her when she was chosen? If I had any really close friends, would they be jealous of me?

That was stupid. I wasn't going to be picked. (Cass, 2012, p. 41)

F. Moral Values

Life is worth the lesson. People learn from something they might think this is good or bad. They make such justification through something which comes within life. It is defined as moral value. In *The Hunger Games*, there are several moral values that reader could learn apparently from the protagonist, Katniss Everdeen. However, at this point, there is exactly one main moral value in which mostly everyone could take chance to learn after reading the novels. That is "stay true to everyone" in order to show you are who you are, as it has been proved as follows.

Somehow Haymitch calling me sweetheart ticks me off enough that I'm at least able to speak. "I shot an arrow at the Gamemakers."

Everyone stops eating. "You what?" The horror in Effie's voice confirms my worse suspicions.

"I shot an arrow at them. Not exactly at them. In their direction. It's like Peeta said, I was shooting and they were ignoring me and I just . . . I just lost my head, so I shot an apple out of their stupid roast pig's mouth!" I say defiantly.

"And what did they say?" says Cinna carefully.

"Nothing. Or I don't know. I walked out after that," I say.

"Without being dismissed?" gasps Effie.

"I dismissed myself," I said. I remember how I promised Prim that I really would try to win and I feel like a ton of coal has dropped on me.

(Collins, 2008, p. 106)

Katniss is a young woman who has courage. It has been explained in comprehensive way above. At this point, Katniss portrays the picture of strong woman.

This situation nearly happens to America Singer, the protagonist in *The Selection*. America keeps herself of being who you are. There is no exception for her to act like what people tell her. She just wants to do what she is willing to do.

"Actually, that was unfair. They're fighting over two things. Some fight for you, others fight for crown. And they all think they've already figured out what to say and do so your choice will be obvious."

"Ah, yes. The man or the crown. I'm afraid some cannot tell the difference." He shook his head.

"Good luck there," I said dryly. (Cass, 2012, p. 116)

Regarding to quotation above, the tone of America to Prince Maxon is not really nice to be sounded like. It seems that America attempts to observe him inappropriately. Since Prince Maxon is a Prince, everyone in the Palace is careful to talk to him. They are afraid of hurting him.

Meanwhile, the situation is vice versa. America thinks that this is not fair to find someone to love. She speaks truthfully to his face without hesitation. At this point, she portrays something that has been being herself (e.g. she is likely to be a person of insistence). She is typically a person of “stays true to everyone,” including Prince Maxon. She has nothing to pretend even to face Prince Maxon.

Both novels are showing the main moral value that everyone should keep her state of being and never change merely because of something. “Be yourself and fear nothing” seems to be the main moral value which the readers could learn. Therefore, it is adequately clear that both novels have things in common on this element.

Differences

Not only similar in several elements, both novels *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection* are different in a few cases. The differences are made to emerge the situation to indicate that author has enormously transformed the previous work into more creative by manifesting several inspirations. The differences of both novels are found in setting of time and type of competition.

A. Setting of Time

Time sets parameter. In *The Hunger Games*, time is comprehensive. It means the time is in certain details such as when the exact event is being held in the novels. Currently, in the novel depicted as it is seen the Games has been running for seventy four years. The time seems to be vague. It is because the characters live in future as the novel tends to point. It is totally fictional, however soon it would be available to today society. The quotation below is to prove.

Then he reads the list of past District 12 victors. In **seventy four years**, we have had exactly two. (Collins, 2008, p. 19)

However, time allocation is vice versa in *The Selection*. It is considered incomprehensive in the novel. It means there is no specific mark to know in what duration an event is encountered. The following quotation will prove.

IN THE MORNING I WOKE not to the sound of the maids coming in—though they had—or my bath being drawn—though it was. I woke to the light coming through my window as Anne gently pulled back the rich, heavy curtains. She hummed a quite song to herself, absolutely happy with her task. (Cass, 2012, p. 119)

Intertextual Relations

Considerable intertextual relations in both novels have vividly proved that *The Hunger Games* has potentially inspired *The Selection* to formulate new fresh work. There are six potential intertextual relations discovered that *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection* related one another as the result of comparing both novel to be grounded by looking at several potential formal elements. As they are as follows.

Firstly, both novels burn the competition down in flames. The idea of the Games burns everything in blood and death has apparently inspired Cass' worldview to burn

the Selection in overwhelming of emotions. Hunger Games is set to be annual game to be forcibly joined by people from twelve districts to win fame and fortune.

Secondly, both novels set stages of class in society. Collins paints class division on society in *The Hunger Games*. Capitol is tyrannical dictatorship led by President Snow, they hold totally political and economic dominance over Panem. Panem is where tributes from District 1 to 12 stay. This is the class domination which Collins desires to portray in her novel. The separation between two places paints the symbolism of class domination.

Thirdly, both novels have their own centerpiece in term of prosperity. The idea of making Capitol as the centerpiece of prosperity inspires Cass to create Kingdom of Illéa as the symbol of prosperity. It means one can rule others. In *The Hunger Games*, Collins paints modern view of Capitol city. The place is where everyone lives in extravagant life. The technology in the city is truly sophisticated. Industries and force fields are everywhere.

Further, both novels construct triangle-love affair formula in the story. The idea of Collins making the three main characters to be attached in string which falls into love affair between three people surrounding with guiltiness has inspired Cass to create the main characters to be involved in such situation. As it can be concluded, even quite similar to *The Hunger Games*, *The Selection* repaints highlight on how complicated the love affair perceived to create shades.

Next, both novels are showing the existence of rebellion in the story. Collins sets the rebels to be set in the past. In case, the story of *The Hunger Games* is not purely telling how the rebels attack the Capitol today, it has vanished for all time in history. While in *The Selection*, Cass desires to bring something more realistic to her sequel of the story. Rebels are everywhere. The Rebels happen to be in the present. They are Northern and Southern attacks.

Lastly, both novels offer fortune and prosperity as if one is to win the competition. The idea of Collins giving their characters compensation as prizes has enormously inspired Cass to create similar idea but still different. Katniss Everdeen and Peeta Mellark win the Seventy-Fourth Annual Hunger Games as couple.

Dealing with intertextuality, it does not mean to stereotypically justify which one is hypogram and transformation simply to discover the originality of a work. Moreover, the level of creativity must be concerned once comprehending dominant elements between literary works. Therefore, it comes to a foreground conclusion that Cass still creates different layers in *The Selection* to reshape what has been perfectly constructed by Collins in *The Hunger Games* way more creative.

CONCLUSION

It is finally found that Suzanne Collins' *The Hunger Games* has potentially inspired Kiera Cass' *The Selection*. It is believed by looking at the elements being compared (e.g. similarities and differences) in order to be able to discover potential intertextual relation between the two literary works concerning as to how creative the development in transformation could achieve.

Nevertheless, literary works may seem to have relation to each other when the tendency of similarities is higher in interpretation. In this part, *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection* are highly similar to one another even though differences may occur in part of interpretation. The similarities are the major characters formula, protagonist, theme, minor characters formula, setting of place, setting of social, moral values and

point of view. Not only two literary works may have something in common but they also have something different. The differences found in *The Hunger Games* and *The Selection* are setting of time and type of game.

The point of the analysis is in discovering potential intertextual relations between both literary works. The potential intertextual elements portrays Collins' *The Hunger Games* inspires *The Selection* to create similar work with more development in spectrum of creativity.

DAFTAR PUSTAKA

- Abrams, M. H. (1993). *A Glossary of Literary Terms*. United States: Thomson Learning.
- Allen, G. (2000). *Intertextuality*. Canada: Routledge.
- Caruso, T. (2016, Augustus Friday). *The Renaissance of Fashion -- Haute Couture Week July 2015*. Retrieved November Wednesday, 2016, from HUFFPOST: <http://m.huffpost.com/us/entry/7922934>
- Cass, K. (2012). *The Selection*. United States: HarperTeen.
- Collins, S. (2008). *The Hunger Games*. United States: Scholastic.
- Collins, S. (2015). *The Hunger Games Award-Winning List*. Retrieved November 24, 2016, from Suzanne Collins Books: suzannecollinsbooks.com/the_hunger_games_69765
- Denzin, N., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2003). *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publication.
- Eliot, T. (1998). *The Sacred Wood and Major Early Essay*. United States: Courier Corporation.
- Faughnder, R. (2016, March 23). 'Hunger Games' Studio Lionsgate Faces a Challenge as Its YA Films Lose Their Appeal. Retrieved November 24, 2016, from Los Angeles Times: <http://latimes.com/entertainment/envelope/cotown/la-et-ct-lionsgate-allegiant-20160323-story.html>
- Fischlin, D., & Fortrier, M. (2000). *Adaptations of Shakespeare: A Critical Anthology of Plays from the 17th Century t the Present*. London: Routledge.
- Jr, M. F. (2015, April 22). Warner Bros Buys YA Title 'The Selection', Sets Black List Scribe Katie Lovejoy to Adapt. Retrieved November 24, 2016, from DEADLINE: <http://deadline.com/2015/04/the-selection-kiera-cass-katie-lovejoy-warner-bros-1201413855>
- Kristeva, J. (1980). *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kristeva, J. (1986). *The Kristeva Reader*. Blackwell: Oxford University Press.
- Natalie, D. (2012, Apri). *Award-Winning Books by Kiera Cass*. Retrieved November 24, 2016, from FICTION DB: <http://www.fictiondb.com/author/kiera-cass~book~awards~68005.htm>
- Snyder, M. H. (2011). *Analyzing Literature-to-Film-Adaptations*. New York: The Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Wesbter, M. (2016, November). Retrieved November Wednesday, 2016, from Merriam Wesbter Famous Dictionary: <http://www.merriam.webster.com/dictionary/dystopia>
- Worton, M., & Sill, J. (1990). *Intertextuality: Theories and Practices*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Yin, R. K. (2011). *Qualitative Research from Start to Finish*. New York: Sage Publications