

**NETWORK MODEL OF LOWER LEVEL BUREAUCRACY
CAPACITY BUILDING IN COMMUNITY EMPOWERMENT
POLICY CASE STUDY OF STREET VENDORS (PKL) POLICY
IMPLEMENTATION IN SOUTH SULAWESI PROVINCE**

Andriyansah¹, Rulinawaty²

^{1,2} Management Study Program, Faculty Economics, Open University, Jl. Jenderal Ahmad Yani
No.43, RT.5/RW.4, Utan Kayu Utara, Kec. Matraman, Kota Jakarta Timur, DKI Jakarta,
Indonesia, andri@ecampus.ut.ac.id

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21107/pamator.v16i4.22056>

Manuscript received November 24th, 2023, Revised December 10th, 2023, Published December
31st, 2023

Abstract

From the results of research on the Lower-Level Bureaucratic Capacity Building Network Model in Community Empowerment Policy: Case Study of Implementation of Limam Foot Vendor (PKL) Policy in South Sulawesi Province. It aims to find effective implementation strategies so that street vendors can participate in world development, especially specifically in the province of South Sulawesi, precisely in the city of Makassar; the focus of this study includes (a). integrated human resource development in implementing street vendor empowerment policies, (b). Partly strengthen the organization in implementing PKL empowerment policies (c) institutions integrated into the collaborative implementation of street vendor empowerment policies. The research results use qualitative methods, such as case study strategic surveys. The data collection techniques used are in-depth interviews, observation, and documentation. The results of the study show that the development of empowerment coaching.

Keywords: Community empowerment policy, human resource development, policy implementation strategy.

© Authors: This is an Open Access Research distributed under the term of the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (CC BY-SA 4.0) (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>), which allows re-distribution and re-use of a licensed work on the conditions that the creator is appropriately credited and that any derivative work is made available under "the same, similar or a compatible license."

INTRODUCTION

In the network approach, organizations working together to achieve goals are more effective than the organization alone. This shows the importance of an organization building networks to achieve common goals, as the organization itself has limited resources to address complex issues and implement its programs.

This approach can also increase the organization's legitimacy, including capacity building so that the organization can improve its performance in achieving its goals¹. The capacity building focuses more on organizational inadequacies, including the inability of officials to carry out their responsibilities and the inability of the organization to function properly. Street Vendors (PKL) are one of the alternative livelihoods in the informal sector that are categorized as small businesses. Small businesses, in the Explanation of Law No. 9 of 1995, are business activities that are able to expand employment and provide broad economic services to the community, can play a role in the process of equalizing and increasing people's income and encouraging economic growth, and play a role in realizing national stability in general and economic stability in particular. Street vendors are often a problem for developing cities, especially for large cities that already have the title of metropolitan. The strong business magnetism of these big cities is able to move people from villages to urbanize in order to switch professions from farmers to small-scale traders. Becoming a street vendor does not require high education does not require large capital but can generate income that sometimes exceeds the formal sector. Street vendors tend to cluster with similar occupations. The most popular type of business is food and beverages.

Some of the problems caused by street vendors in various cities are usually similar, such as congestion, cleanliness, and city beauty. This is because street vendors sometimes tend to trade in places that are not allowed to trade². Meanwhile, buying and selling activities have been facilitated by the existence of permanent kiosks or stalls and have fulfilled all the requirements to obtain rights as market tenants whose rights are protected by law and safe from eviction. Makassar City is the fourth largest city in Indonesia and the largest in Eastern Indonesia. it has an area of 175.79 km² with data registered at the Makassar City Family Planning Agency, reaching 265 thousand households with a population of 1.67 million people in 2017. This data continues to change along with the dynamics of the population, so Makassar City can be said to be a metropolitan city. One of the causes of the large population in Makassar City is the increasing number of migrants from outside Makassar City from year to year to try their luck and continue their education in Makassar City. People who come to the city from rural areas to look for work are generally poor urbanites³. However, they feel that the opportunity to live, get a job, and a better salary is more likely than if they had remained in the village. The presence of street vendors in Makassar City is often found to cause problems related to the disturbance of security and public order. The impression of slums, wildness, and destruction of beauty seems to be a patent attached to this micro-enterprise. These problems have a relationship with the arrangement of street vendors. In reality, the policy on regulating business places for street vendors is basically contained in Regional Regulation Number 10 of 1990 concerning the Development of Street Vendors in Makassar City.

The implementation of street vendor policies in Makassar City is substantively

¹ Jemima Pierre, 'The Racial Vernaculars of Development: A View from West Africa', *American Anthropologist*, 122.1 (2020), 86–98 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/aman.13352>>.

² Alwi and Rulinawaty Kasmad, 'KEBIJAKAN PEMERINTAH DAN PEMBERDAYAAN MASYARAKAT : Studi Kasus Program Gernas Kakao Di Luwu Utara', *Jurnal Administrasi Negara STIA LAN Makassar*, 19 (2013).

³ M. Lipton, *Why Poor People Stay Poor* (Routledge, 2023).

focused on three aspects of policy implementation: the provision of counseling and technical guidance, the arrangement of places and times of business, and the arrangement of licensing rules. The implementation of the policy aimed at street vendors is hierarchically carried out by the City Government, assisted by the Sub-District Head and Head of Village in each working area, as well as coordinating and cooperating with other related agencies⁴. In addition, there are other institutions that play a role in the implementation of the coaching policy, namely LPM and LSM (implementors). The objectives of the policy can be achieved by considering external and internal factors⁵. The environmental aspect is considered to be one of the factors determining the success of the implementation of a policy product⁶. If these factors do not contribute less support to the implementation of the policy in the field, then the implementation of this coaching policy will be less successful in achieving the expected goals of street vendors. Conversely, if these influential factors contribute significantly to the implementation of the policy, then the implementation of the coaching policy will succeed in achieving its goals and objectives, namely increasing knowledge of rights and obligations, having the ability to develop their business with the availability of a beautifully organized and clean business place, having a permit and complying with their obligation to pay retribution, as well as having implications for increasing their income.

Based on the above phenomenon, the author will verify the network model of organizational capacity building to implement street vendor empowerment policies in Makassar City. This model is a combination of the Grindel Model of organizational capacity building and inter-organizational network theory. Combining the two theories into an organizational capacity-building network theory, which includes integrated human resource development, integrated organizational strengthening, and integrated institutional reform.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research uses a qualitative approach. The basic reason for using qualitative research is that the problems that arise in the process of formulating network-based policies emphasize the process more. The decision-making process of the Ammatoa Kajang indigenous community is a crucial study for all parties/actors involved in the process who, in fact, have different backgrounds and interests. Denzin and Lincoln (2009) said that qualitative research places more emphasis on process and meaning⁷. The

⁴ Guntur Eko Saputro and Lukman Yudho Prakoso, 'Implementation of Economic Policies Facing Covid 19 in Supporting Nonmilitary Defense', *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research*, 04.04 (2021), 634–42 <<https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v4-i4-11>>.

⁵ Dinh Tran Ngoc Huy and others, 'Impacts of Internal and External Macroeconomic Factors on Firm Stock Price in an Expansion Econometric Model—A Case in Vietnam Real Estate Industry', *Studies in Computational Intelligence*, 898 (2021), 189–205 <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-48853-6_14>.

⁶ Shahla Asadi and others, 'Investigating Influence of Green Innovation on Sustainability Performance: A Case on Malaysian Hotel Industry', *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 258 (2020), 1–15 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.120860>>.

⁷ Hossein Nassaji, 'Good Qualitative Research', *Language Teaching Research*, 24.4 (2020), 427–31 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168820941288>>.

location of this research is Makassar City, with the consideration that it has many street vendors compared to other cities in South Sulawesi Province. Street vendors are also a serious problem because they can cause chaos and traffic congestion in the city. The number of street vendors was around 14,000 in 2013. Having competence related to the implementation of street vendor empowerment policies in Makassar. The determination is based on the judgment of experts (or the researcher himself) for a specific purpose or a specific situation⁸. The informants in this study are (a) the Mayor of Makassar City; (b) Community Empowerment Agency (LPM); (c) Coordination Team for Street Vendor Arrangement and Empowerment; (d) Head of Makassar City Trade Office; (e) Street Vendors in Makassar City; (f) LSM related to street vendors; and (g) Community leaders in Makassar City.

The data collection techniques used in this research according to Rutakumwa et al. (2020) are observation, in-depth interviews, and documents. Observations were made mainly related to tangible objects, such as the condition of the place and the goods sold by street vendors. In-depth interviews were conducted with the informants mentioned above, while the documentation technique is to collect documents such as regulations, journals, and research results related to this research⁹. In qualitative research, data processing and analysis are inseparable activities. This can be seen in the stages of qualitative data analysis proposed by Miles and Huberman (1992) in Milanrianto et al (2023), namely data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification. This research uses a case study analysis strategy, where the analysis used is an explanatory technique¹⁰.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Based on the description in the previous chapter, this study focuses on increasing the capacity of local governments in an integrated manner in the implementation of street vendor empowerment policies in Makassar City. Integrated local government capacity-building models include the following.

Policy on fostering street vendors in Makassar City

Various efforts have been made by the city government at the sub-district and village levels, and other related agencies functionally have a coaching task that seeks to implement government policies regarding the development of street vendors, including epe banana traders. In the context of the discussion of the results of this study, the implementation of the policy of fostering street vendors, in this case, pie and banana

⁸ Stefanie Mauksch, Heiko A. von der Gracht, and Theodore J. Gordon, 'Who Is an Expert for Foresight? A Review of Identification Methods', *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 154 (2020), 1–14 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2020.119982>>.

⁹ Rwamahe Rutakumwa and others, 'Conducting In-Depth Interviews with and without Voice Recorders: A Comparative Analysis', *Qualitative Research*, 20.5 (2020), 565–81 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794119884806>>.

¹⁰ Bayu Afkar Milanrianto, Dira Permana, and Sri Ariani, 'Cognitive and Social Strategies to Deal With Anxiety in Speaking: Typical Strategies and Application', *Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 11.3 (2023), 502–14 <<https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v11i3.8441>>.

traders, which includes aspects of the implementation of policies for providing counseling and guidance, structuring the place and time of business and licensing policies aimed at street vendors in the Makassar City area, such as the issuance of Regional Regulation No. 2 of 1990 concerning the Development of Street Vendors in Ujung Pandang City. This was followed by the issuance of Makassar Mayor Decree No. 01 of 2002. These result based on Kurniadi & Sumarna (2022) research, that authorized the sub-district heads to control and guide street vendors in their respective working areas in coordination with other relevant agencies¹¹. The implementation of counseling on the authority of the Makassar city government in conducting guidance and arrangement of street vendors coordinated and facilitated by the Makassar City Information and Communication Office.

The process of empowering street vendors in Makassar City

The results of this study based on the results of interviews with Disperindag employees obtained an explanation that the empowerment process carried out by Disperindag to street vendors has several models, namely counseling and socialization carried out by conducting a socialization process with street vendors with distributors as raw material providers gathered somewhere usually held at a hotel for meetings and conducting socialization. Budi et al (2022) states, the coaching model carried out by Disperindag on Street Vendors is carried out in various ways or methods depending on the coaching model¹². For the coaching model carried out by Disperindag on Street Vendors, as follows: (a). Counseling for coaching models with counseling usually Disperindag employees go directly to the field in providing counseling by providing explanations on matters relating to factors that can support the improvement of the business of street vendors. (b). For socialization, Disperindag conducts it in the form of a workshop over several days by gathering the street vendors in an adequate place to provide comfort to the participants so that they can easily understand what the speakers say at the meeting. This training aims to enable them to manage their business properly¹³. Then, the partnership business is a coaching model that is implemented by conducting a partnership business meeting, namely by bringing together distributors with street vendors so that street vendors who sell merchandise such as culinary snacks can get lower raw material prices because they are directly from distributors.

Empowerment of street vendors in Makassar City

Preparation: The empowerment technique carried out in the empowerment of street vendors in Makassar City is the initial stage with the preparation of the approach to be taken to street vendors by means of local governments placing their position into the environment of street vendors as the target of the empowerment program so that street

¹¹ Kurniadi Kurniadi and Ema Sumarna, 'The Process of Collaboration in Regulating Street Vendors in Bandung City', *Qualitative Report*, 27.5 (2022), 1439–55 <<https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2022.5458>>.

¹² Rahardjo Budi and others, 'Performance Improvement Of Food Cluster Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs) In Magelang City', *Jurnal Ekonomi*, 27.3 (2022), 358–79 <<https://doi.org/10.24912/je.v27i3.1137>>.

¹³ Colin Mayer, 'The Future of the Corporation and the Economics of Purpose', *Journal of Management Studies*, 58.3 (2021), 887–901 <<https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3731539>>.

vendors can participate in the existing order. Needs: In this stage of empowerment of street vendors in Makassar City, in accordance with the results of the study that in identifying the problems that exist in street vendors, the local government identifies various problems that exist in street vendors, namely regarding the issue of order and cleanliness of the traders' environment. Evaluation: In the evaluation stage of this empowerment, the local government also continuously supervises, including the level of achievement of goals in empowering street vendors in Makassar city. Termination: For the follow-up of the empowerment activities of street vendors in Makassar City after this empowerment activity, the government always conducts follow-up in the form of guidance on orders in trading.

Integrated human resource development in the implementation of street vendor empowerment policy in Makassar City

Table 2. Description of Integrated Human Resources Development in the Implementation of Street Vendor Empowerment Policy in Makassar City

District	Training	Incentives	Working conditions	Deployment
Ujung Pandang	Yes: service customer	Yes	Not conducive	Citizen representative
Makassar	No	Yes	Not conducive	Citizen representative
Bantoala	No	Yes	Not conducive	Citizen representative

Based on Table 2 above, only LPM administrators in Ujung Pandang sub-district have received friendly customer service training from KFC administrators in Makassar City, while other sub-districts have not. All LPM administrators except for the chairperson do not receive incentives from the government. Similarly, all LPMs in Makassar have unfavorable working conditions because they need their own offices. LPM cadres are recruited by representatives of each community leader in the neighborhood (RW).

Integrated human resource development in the implementation of street vendor empowerment policy in Makassar City

LPM in Makassar City, as a network-based organization that empowers street vendors in Makassar City, has not provided training to its cadres and street vendors on community empowerment, even though LPM is a community empowerment institution whose cadres should all have experience and expertise in this field. Similarly, based on Rahmayanti et al (2022), incentives as motivators for cadres are very limited, with only

the LPM head and debt collectors receiving incentives from the revolving fund program, which is focused on small grocery traders, including street vendors¹⁴. No less important than incentives are the working conditions, which are not conducive, as the LPM does not yet have an office as a workplace, and there has been no effort by the Makassar City Government to build one. Another component of this concept is recruitment, as LPM also does not recruit street vendor cadres who have empowerment experience¹⁵. All LPM members are citizen representatives who have no experience in street vendor empowerment. Based on Table 2 above, LPM does not develop human resource development programs and implement them in an integrated manner. This happens because LPM members have no experience in this regard. Scott et al (2022) states, as a network-based organization, members should pay attention to community empowerment as a characteristic of network-based organizations¹⁶. All members or cadres of LPM Makassar City are just a group of community leaders who are not a group of street vendor empowerment experts who can help the government overcome various problems related to street vendor empowerment.

Integrated institutional reform in the Implementation of Street Vendor empowerment Policy in Makassar City

LPM, as a network-based organization whose working system resembles the bureaucratic system, has resulted in resistance to change. It can be seen that when Makassar City changed its vision to "Makassar as a World City," LPM was still a bureaucratic structure that was not able to adapt to the changes¹⁷. It is only a symbol of community empowerment in its area, as there is no program designed to empower street vendors in Makassar City. This is because LPM was born from the government's formation to empower the community, including street vendors. It was not created from the strong desire of local community leaders¹⁸. Based on the experience of world community development figures, including Muhammad Durán-Díaz et al. (2020), community development organizations are born from the collective awareness of

¹⁴ Widi Rahmayanti and others, 'Factors Related to the Performance of Cadres in the Implementation of Community Based Health Service Activities', *Journal of Public Health Sciences*, 1.02 (2022), 55–70 <<https://doi.org/10.56741/jphs.v1i02.82>>.

¹⁵ Sofjan Aripin, Rulinawaty, and Lukman Samboteng, 'Agile Bureaucracy for Public Policy Accountability: Implementation of the Street Vendor Policy in Indonesia', *Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Administration Science 2020 (ICAS 2020)*, 564. Icas 2020 (2021), 108–16 <<https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210629.021>>.

¹⁶ Stephanie Scott, Mathew Hughes, and Domingo Ribeiro-Soriano, *Towards a Network-Based View of Effective Entrepreneurial Ecosystems*, *Review of Managerial Science* (Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2022), XVI <<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11846-021-00440-5>>.

¹⁷ Nani Harlinda Nurdin, Zulkarnain Hamson, and Askariani Sahur, 'Institutional Village Strengthening Model in Completing Standar Minimum of Human Development', *KEMUDI: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 6.02 (2022), 111–19 <<https://doi.org/10.31629/kemudi.v6i02.3317>>.

¹⁸ Anthony Charles and others, 'Community Science: A Typology and Its Implications for Governance of Social-Ecological Systems', *Environmental Science and Policy*, 106 (2020), 77–86 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsci.2020.01.019>>.

members of the organization, and the community will be empowered¹⁹. This means that there is no Down empowerment policy because such a policy will not create community awareness. LPM in Makassar was born from a Top-Down approach. This can be seen from the revolving fund program for the poor issued by the Makassar City Government. This program did not raise the awareness of street vendors not to conduct economic activities in places prohibited by the government and places that congest traffic.

CONCLUSIONS

The results of the study show that the development of empowerment guidance for street vendors in the city of Makassar has largely been running in accordance with the rules set by the local regulation and carried out consistently. However, the implementation of the policy has not been optimal because many aspects related to handling street vendors continue to carry out their activities in the red zone area. According to Wanzenböck & Frenken (2020), public policy is "A series of actions that are determined and implemented or not implemented by the government that has certain goals or are oriented towards certain goals for the benefit of the entire community." (The various efforts that the city government has made to the sub-district and village levels as well as other related agencies functionally have a coaching task that seeks to implement government policies regarding the development of street vendors including banana epe traders²⁰. In the context of the discussion of the results of this study, the implementation of the policy of fostering street vendors, in this case, ban, and traders, which includes aspects of the implementation of the policy of providing counseling and guidance, structuring the place and time of business and licensing policies aimed at street vendors in the Makassar City area, such as with the issuance of local regulations. (b). Empowerment Process of Street Vendors in Makassar City, The process of empowering street vendors in Makassar City in the results of this study based on the results of interviews with Disperindag employees obtained an explanation that the empowerment process carried out by Disperindag to street vendors has several models, namely counseling and socialization carried out by conducting a socialization process with street vendors with distributors as raw material providers gathered somewhere usually held at a hotel for meetings and conducting socialization. (c). Empowerment of Street Vendors in Makassar City Preparation: The empowerment technique carried out in the empowerment of street vendors in Makassar City is the initial stage with the preparation of the approach that will be taken to street vendors by means of the local government placing their position into the environment of street vendors as the target of the empowerment program so that street vendors can participate in the existing order. needs: In this stage of empowering street vendors in Makassar City in accordance with the results of the study that in identifying the problems that exist in street vendors, the local government identifies various problems that exist in street vendors, namely regarding the issue of order and cleanliness in the traders' environment. (e). Integrated human resource development in the implementation of street vendor empowerment policies in Makassar City LPM in

¹⁹ Pamela Durán-Díaz and others, 'Community Development through the Empowerment of Indigenous Women in Cuetzalan Del Progreso, Mexico', *Land*, 9.5 (2020) <<https://doi.org/10.3390/LAND9050163>>.

²⁰ Iris Wanzenböck and Koen Frenken, 'The Subsidiarity Principle in Innovation Policy for Societal Challenges', *Global Transitions*, 2 (2020), 51–59 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.glt.2020.02.002>>.

Makassar City, as a network-based organization that empowers street vendors in Makassar City, has not provided training to its cadres and street vendors on community empowerment, even though LPM is a community empowerment institution whose cadres must all have experience and expertise in this field.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adrian Tawai. 2013. 'Pengembangan Kapasitas'Alwi, and Rulinawaty Kasmad, 'Kebijakan Pemerintah Dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat: Studi Kasus Program Gernas Kakao Di Luwu Utara', *Jurnal Administrasi Negara STIA LAN Makassar*, 19 (2013)
- Aripin, Sofjan, Rulinawaty, and Lukman Samboteng, 'Agile Bureaucracy for Public Policy Accountability: Implementation of the Street Vendor Policy in Indonesia', *Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Administration Science 2020 (ICAS 2020)*, 564.Icas 2020 (2021), 108–16 <<https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210629.021>>
- Asadi, Shahla, Pourhashemi Seyedeh OmSalameh, Mehrbakhsh Nilashi, Rusli Abdullah, Sarminah Samad, Elaheh Yadegaridehkordi, and others, 'Investigating Influence of Green Innovation on Sustainability Performance: A Case on Malaysian Hotel Industry', *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 258 (2020), 1–15 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.120860>>
- Budi, Rahardjo, Khairul Ikhwan, Ratnawati Shinta, and Ari Wibowo Hendi, 'Performance Improvement Of Food Cluster Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs) In Magelang City', *Jurnal Ekonomi*, 27.3 (2022), 358–79 <<https://doi.org/10.24912/je.v27i3.1137>>
- Charles, Anthony, Laura Loucks, Fikret Berkes, and Derek Armitage, 'Community Science: A Typology and Its Implications for Governance of Social-Ecological Systems', *Environmental Science and Policy*, 106 (2020), 77–86 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsci.2020.01.019>>
- Durán-Díaz, Pamela, Adriana Armenta-Ramírez, Anne Kristiina Kurjenoja, and Melissa Schumacher, 'Community Development through the Empowerment of Indigenous Women in Cuetzalan Del Progreso, Mexico', *Land*, 9.5 (2020) <<https://doi.org/10.3390/LAND9050163>>
- Huy, Dinh Tran Ngoc, Vo Kim Nhan, Nguyen Thi Ngoc Bich, Nguyen Thi Phuong Hong, Nham Thanh Chung, and Pham Quang Huy, 'Impacts of Internal and External Macroeconomic Factors on Firm Stock Price in an Expansion Econometric Model—A Case in Vietnam Real Estate Industry', *Studies in Computational Intelligence*, 898 (2021), 189–205 <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-48853-6_14>
- Kurniadi, Kurniadi, and Ema Sumarna, 'The Process of Collaboration in Regulating Street Vendors in Bandung City', *Qualitative Report*, 27.5 (2022), 1439–55 <<https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2022.5458>>
- Lipton, M., *Why Poor People Stay Poor* (Routledge, 2023)

- Mauksch, Stefanie, Heiko A. von der Gracht, and Theodore J. Gordon, 'Who Is an Expert for Foresight? A Review of Identification Methods', *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 154 (2020), 1–14 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2020.119982>>
- Mayer, Colin, 'The Future of the Corporation and the Economics of Purpose', *Journal of Management Studies*, 58.3 (2021), 887–901 <<https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3731539>>
- Milanrianto, Bayu Afkar, Dira Permana, and Sri Ariani, 'Cognitive and Social Strategies to Deal With Anxiety in Speaking: Typical Strategies and Application', *Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 11.3 (2023), 502–14 <<https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v11i3.8441>>
- Nassaji, Hossein, 'Good Qualitative Research', *Language Teaching Research*, 24.4 (2020), 427–31 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168820941288>>
- Nurdin, Nani Harlinda, Zulkarnain Hamson, and Askariani Sahur, 'Institutional Village Strengthening Model in Completing Standar Minimum of Human Development', *KEMUDI: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 6.02 (2022), 111–19 <<https://doi.org/10.31629/kemudi.v6i02.3317>>
- Pierre, Jemima, 'The Racial Vernaculars of Development: A View from West Africa', *American Anthropologist*, 122.1 (2020), 86–98 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/aman.13352>>
- Rahmayanti, Widi, Sinta Fitriani, Wuri Ratna Hidayani, Dadan Yogaswara, Lorraine Turiano, and Kenny Nino H. Tagum, 'Factors Related to the Performance of Cadres in the Implementation of Community Based Health Service Activities', *Journal of Public Health Sciences*, 1.02 (2022), 55–70 <<https://doi.org/10.56741/jphs.v1i02.82>>
- Reypens, Charlotte, Annouk Lievens, and Vera Blazevic, 'Hybrid Orchestration in Multi-Stakeholder Innovation Networks: Practices of Mobilizing Multiple, Diverse Stakeholders across Organizational Boundaries', *Organization Studies*, 42.1 (2021), 61–83 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0170840619868268>>
- Rutakumwa, Rwamahe, Joseph Okello Mugisha, Sarah Bernays, Elizabeth Kabunga, Grace Tumwekwase, Martin Mbonye, and others, 'Conducting In-Depth Interviews with and without Voice Recorders: A Comparative Analysis', *Qualitative Research*, 20.5 (2020), 565–81 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794119884806>>
- Saputro, Guntur Eko, and Lukman Yudho Prakoso, 'Implementation of Economic Policies Facing Covid 19 in Supporting Nonmilitary Defense', *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research*, 04.04 (2021), 634–42 <<https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v4-i4-11>>
- Scott, Stephanie, Mathew Hughes, and Domingo Ribeiro-Soriano, *Towards a Network-Based View of Effective Entrepreneurial Ecosystems*, *Review of Managerial Science* (Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2022), xvi <<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11846-021-00440-5>>

Wanzenböck, Iris, and Koen Frenken, 'The Subsidiarity Principle in Innovation Policy for Societal Challenges', *Global Transitions*, 2 (2020), 51–59
<<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.glt.2020.02.002>>