

INTEGRATION OF LABOR LAW IN ISLAMIC LAW AND CIVIL LAW CITIZENSHIP IN INDONESIA (HARMONIZATION OF PRINCIPLES AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETY)

Weny Almoravid Dunga¹, Awad Al-Khalaf²

¹ Faculty of Law, Gorontalo State University, Jl. Jendral Sudirman, No. 6 Kota Gorontalo,
Gorontalo Province, Indonesia, wenyad@ung.ac.id

² College of Sharia and Islamic Studies, University of Sharjah, Sharjah, United Arab Emirates,
alkhalaf@sharjah.ac.ae

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21107/pamator.v15i2.19812>

Manuscript received 10th April 2022, Revised 15th August 2022, Published 15th October 2022

Abstract

Integrating labor law into Islamic and civil law is a process to harmonize principles and implementation in contemporary society. Does this study aim to answer (1) How can labor law principles in Islamic law be integrated with civil law for citizenship to create harmonization in its implementation? Moreover, (2) What challenges and obstacles are faced in integrating Labor Law into Islamic Law and Citizenship Civil Law in contemporary society? This study's research type is the normative juridical method, whose other name is doctrinal legal research, also known as library research or document study. The research results show that to integrate the principles of labor law in Islamic law with civil law on citizenship, several strategic steps need to be taken—first, open dialogue and discussion between Islamic law experts and civil law on citizenship. Second, they draft laws and regulations that accommodate the principles and norms of both legal systems. Third, involving inclusive and interdisciplinary legal education and fourth, educating the public about the benefits and objectives of integrating labor law into Islamic and civil law on citizenship. Fifth, increase cooperation between countries and international organizations.

Keywords: Harmonization, Labor, Islamic, Civil Law, Contemporary Society

© Authors; This is an Open Access Research distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (CC BY-SA 4.0) (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>), which allows re-distribution and re-use of a licensed work on the condition that the creator is properly credited and that any derivative work is made available under "the same, similar or a compatible license".

INTRODUCTION

In a global context, various legal systems apply in various countries, including labor law. For example, Islamic law is important in regulating labor in some countries with a majority Muslim population. In contrast, in other countries, civil law on citizenship is the

main reference.¹ Therefore, it is important to understand how labor law principles in Islamic law and civil law can be integrated and implemented in contemporary society.

Integrating Labor Law into Islamic Law and the Civil Code of Citizenship creates an opportunity to combine the principles in these two legal systems, aiming to create a more inclusive and fair legal framework.

Islamic law, also known as Sharia, regulates various aspects of life, including the relationship between employer and employee.² The labor law principles in Islamic Law are based on the values of justice, honesty and mutual welfare.³ On the other hand, Citizenship Civil Law includes rules and laws implemented by the state to regulate employment relations.⁴ These legal systems are usually more flexible and adaptive to economic and social developments.⁵

Considering the principles of employment law in Islamic law and civil law, several aspects need to be considered in order to create an inclusive and fair legal framework:

1. Justice

In Islamic Law, justice is the main principle that underlies the relationship between employers and workers. This includes fair treatment of workers in terms of compensation, working conditions and development opportunities. The Citizenship Civil Law also emphasizes the importance of fairness in employment relations through laws regulating employers' and workers' rights and obligations. Therefore, harmonizing the two legal systems can create a legal framework that more effectively upholds the principle of justice.

2. Honesty

Islamic law prioritizes honesty as a principle in employment relations, which includes honesty in employment contracts, transparency, and responsibility. On the other hand, the Citizenship Civil Law regulates regulations that guarantee honesty and transparency in employment relations, such as provisions regarding work contracts and disclosure of information. The integration of these two legal systems can help ensure honesty and transparency in employment relationships.

¹ M Berger, 'Comparative Law and the Legal System of Employment Relations', *International Journal of Comparative Labor Law and Industrial Relations*, 32.1 (2016), 13.

² S Hasan, 'Islamic Law and the Workplace: A Study of Labor Rights in Islamic Jurisprudence', *Journal of Islamic Law Review*, 11.2 (2015), 157.

³ MN Siddiqi, 'Employment Relations in Islam: A Normative View', *The Islamic Quarterly*, 57.1 (2013), 36.

⁴ René David and John EC Brierley, *Major Legal Systems in the World Today: An Introduction to the Comparative Study of Law* (Simon and Schuster, 1978), p. 84.

⁵ Katz, HC (2012). *Comparative Employment and Labor Law*. in Guy Davidov and Brian Langille, *The Idea of Labor Law* (USA: Oxford University Press, 2011).

3. Shared welfare

Islamic law emphasizes the importance of creating mutual welfare for employers and workers. This includes protecting workers' rights, such as adequate wages, rest and work safety. The Civil Code of Citizenship also has regulations that protect workers' rights, such as laws regarding minimum wages, working hours, and leave entitlements. The integration of the principle of mutual welfare from these two legal systems can create a better working environment for all parties involved.

4. Flexibility and adaptability

Citizenship Civil Law is more flexible and adaptive to economic and social changes. This allows the legal system to adapt to societal needs and create effective regulation. In integrating the principles of Islamic Law, it is important to maintain this flexibility so that the resulting legal system can accommodate the diverse needs of contemporary society.

Integration between Labor Law in Islamic Law and Citizenship Civil Law is important to create harmonization in a multicultural and pluralistic society.⁶This integration is also expected to provide more inclusive and fair solutions in dealing with various employment problems that are often faced by society.⁷However, the challenges and obstacles in implementing this integration must be understood and handled wisely to create an effective and efficient legal system.

In the background that has been described, the problems that arise related to the integration of Labor Law into Islamic Law and Civil Law of Citizenship include:

1. Differences in principles and approaches

Islamic and Citizenship Civil Law have different principles and approaches in regulating employment relations. Islamic Law emphasizes the values of justice, honesty and common welfare, while Civil Law on Citizenship is more flexible and adaptive to economic and social changes. This is a challenge in creating an inclusive and fair legal framework.

2. The need to create an inclusive and fair legal framework

Given the differences in the principles and approaches of these two legal systems, it is important to find ways to integrate them within an inclusive and equitable legal framework that can accommodate the diverse needs of contemporary society.

⁶ Prakash Shah, *Legal Pluralism in Conflict: Coping with Cultural Diversity in Law* (United States: Psychology Press, 2005), p. 34.

⁷ An-Na'im AA (2016). *Cultural Transformation and Human Rights in Africa: Implementing the Universality of Human Rights in the Context of Legal Pluralism*. in András Koltay, *Comparative Perspectives on the Fundamental Freedom of Expression* (Wolters Kluwer Ltd., 2015), p. 14.

3. Harmonization between Islamic Law and Citizenship Civil Law

Given the differences, there needs to be a serious effort to create harmonization between the two legal systems to produce inclusive and fair solutions in dealing with various employment problems.

4. Challenges and obstacles in implementing integration

In integrating labor law into Islamic law and civil law, there are bound to be challenges and obstacles that must be understood and handled wisely. This includes differences in views, customs and cultures across countries and challenges in maintaining the flexibility and adaptability of the resulting legal system.

In order to create a harmonious and inclusive society, the integration of Labor Law into Islamic Law and Civil Law on Citizenship is an important step that needs to be pursued. While some challenges and obstacles must be overcome, continued efforts to incorporate the principles of the two legal systems will help create an effective, efficient and fair legal framework. Thus, a multicultural and pluralistic society can jointly achieve prosperity and justice in the world of work.

The integration of labor law in Islamic law and civil law citizenship in Indonesia is a topic that has not been extensively researched, and therefore, presents an opportunity for novelty in the following ways:

1. Harmonization of legal principles: The integration of labor law in Islamic law and civil law citizenship involves the harmonization of legal principles that have different origins and values. This presents an opportunity for exploring the process of harmonization and identifying the challenges and opportunities it presents.
2. Cultural and social implications: Indonesia is a country with a diverse cultural and religious background, and the integration of labor law in Islamic law and civil law citizenship has cultural and social implications. This presents an opportunity to explore the cultural and social implications of the integration and identify the opportunities and challenges it presents.
3. Contemporary society: The implementation of labor law in Islamic law and civil law citizenship in contemporary society presents unique challenges and opportunities, given the dynamic nature of contemporary society. This presents an opportunity to explore how the integration can be implemented effectively in contemporary society, taking into account the changing social, economic, and technological landscape.
4. Comparative analysis: The integration of labor law in Islamic law and civil law citizenship can be analyzed comparatively with other countries that have implemented similar initiatives. This presents an opportunity for comparative analysis and identifying best practices that can be applied in Indonesia.

In conclusion, the integration of labor law in Islamic law and civil law citizenship in Indonesia presents several opportunities for novelty in terms of exploring the harmonization of legal principles, cultural and social implications, implementation in contemporary society, and comparative analysis.

Based on the discussion above, this study will try to answer the (1) How can labor law principles in Islamic law be integrated with the civil law of citizenship to create harmonization in its implementation? Furthermore, (2) What challenges and obstacles are faced in implementing the integration between Labor Law in Islamic Law and Citizenship Civil Law in contemporary society?

RESEARCH METHODS

The type of research in this study is the normative juridical method, whose other name is doctrinal legal research, also known as library research or document study because this research is carried out or is aimed only at written regulations or other legal materials.⁸ While the approach taken in writing this thesis is a statute approach, the statutory approach (statute approach) is used to examine statutory regulations in their normalization. This approach examines all statutory regulations related to the problems (legal issues) faced. Research that obtains legal materials by collecting and analyzing legal materials related to the issues to be discussed. Legal research is carried out to find solutions to legal issues that arise. Therefore, legal research is research within a know-how framework within the law. The result achieved is to provide a prescription regarding what should be the issue raised.⁹

DISCUSSION

Islamic and civil perspectives on labor principles are influenced by different legal systems and cultural contexts, resulting in some differences and similarities between the two. Some of the key differences and similarities are discussed below:

1. Differences:

- a. Source of authority: The source of authority for labor principles in Islamic law is the Quran and the Hadith, whereas civil law principles are derived from the constitution, statutes, and judicial decisions.
- b. Concept of ownership: Islamic law recognizes the concept of ownership as a trust from Allah, while civil law recognizes it as a legal right. This difference in concept affects the principles of labor, especially with regard to the employer-employee relationship.
- c. Contractual obligations: In Islamic law, contractual obligations are based on moral and ethical principles, whereas in civil law, they are based on legal principles. This difference in the basis of contractual obligations affects the principles of labor, especially with regard to the obligations and rights of employers and employees.
- d. Prohibition of interest: Islamic law prohibits the charging and receiving of interest, while civil law allows it. This prohibition affects the principles of labor, especially with regard to the payment of wages and other forms of compensation.

⁸ Soerjono Soekanto and Sri Mamudji, 'Normative Legal Research An Overview', in Rajawali Pers, Jakarta, 2007, p. 14.

⁹ Peter Mahmud Marzuki, Introduction to Law Studies Revised Edition (Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2008), p. 83.

2. Similarities:

- a. Protection of workers: Both Islamic and civil law recognize the need to protect workers from exploitation and discrimination. Both legal systems provide for the protection of workers' rights to fair wages, safe working conditions, and social security.
- b. Non-discrimination: Both Islamic and civil law prohibit discrimination on the basis of gender, race, religion, and other factors. Both legal systems recognize the importance of equal treatment and opportunities for all workers.
- c. Just and fair treatment: Both Islamic and civil law require employers to treat their employees justly and fairly. Both legal systems recognize the importance of respecting the rights and dignity of workers.
- d. Dispute resolution: Both Islamic and civil law provide for mechanisms for the resolution of disputes between employers and employees. Both legal systems recognize the importance of resolving disputes fairly and efficiently.

In conclusion, while there are some differences in the principles of labor between Islamic and civil perspectives, there are also many similarities. Both legal systems recognize the importance of protecting workers, prohibiting discrimination, treating workers justly and fairly, and providing mechanisms for the resolution of disputes.

The Principles of Employment Law in Islamic Law Can Be Integrated With Citizenship Civil Law To Create Harmonization In Its Implementation. Islamic law, also known as Shari'a or Sharia Law, is a legal system that originates in the Qur'an and Hadith.¹⁰ Islamic law covers various aspects of life, including labor law.

The main principles of labor law in Islamic Law include the following:

1. Fair and honest¹¹

The concept of fairness and honesty in the relationship between employers and workers in Islamic Law emphasizes the importance of moral and ethical aspects in the world of work. Conceptually, this principle covers three main aspects: fair wages, reasonable working hours and good treatment of workers. In practice, employers must fulfill workers' rights and protect workers. This includes providing reasonable wages, guaranteeing occupational safety and health of workers, providing adequate facilities, and ensuring social security for workers. Employees are also expected to carry out their duties with full responsibility and trustworthiness and to work as well as possible for the common good. By implementing the principles of fairness and honesty in the relationship between employers and workers,

¹⁰ Christopher Alexander, 'opportunities, Organizations, And Ideas: Islamic And Workers In Tunisia And Algeria', *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 32.4 (2000), 465–90 (p. 465) <<https://doi.org/10.1017/S0020743800021176>>.

¹¹ William Easterly, 'The Political Economy of Growth Without Development: A Case Study of Pakistan', *Search of Prosperity, Analytic Narratives on Economic Growth* Princeton, 2003.

2. Mutual agreement¹²

Islamic law requires both parties to agree upon an agreement or employment contract between the employer and the worker. This agreement must be clear and binding, including the rights and obligations of each party. Work agreements or contracts must include several important things, such as salary or wages, work hours, leave, occupational health and safety protection, and other relevant rights. The employment contract must be drawn up and signed by both parties as a formal agreement. Employment agreements or contracts can be renewed or revised if conditions or requirements change in the employment relationship. However, such changes must be made with transparency and consultation with both parties.

3. Responsibility and trust¹³

Employees are expected to carry out their duties with full responsibility and trustworthiness and work as well as possible for the common good. In practice, workers must carry out their duties and responsibilities properly and follow the procedures set by the employer. Employees must also avoid actions that violate ethics and morals at work and communicate properly with employers and colleagues. By understanding and implementing the concepts of responsibility and trust at work, employees will be able to make a positive contribution to the company and society as a whole.

4. Protect workers' rights¹⁴

Islamic law teaches the importance of protecting workers' rights, such as the right to fair wages, adequate rest, and a safe work environment. In practice, employers must fulfill workers' rights and protect workers. This includes providing reasonable wages, guaranteeing occupational safety and health of workers, providing adequate facilities, and ensuring social security for workers. In addition, workers must also fulfill their duties and responsibilities properly and follow the procedures set by the employer. Understanding and implementing the concept of protecting workers' rights in Islamic Law will likely create a healthy, safe and productive work environment.

Meanwhile, the Citizenship Civil Law also regulates aspects of employment, such as the rights and obligations of employers and workers, protection of workers' rights, and mechanisms for resolving labor disputes.¹⁵In this context, the integration of the principles

¹² Ayaz Asadov, 'Fatwa Making in the Context of Abnormal Justice: The Case of Migrant Workers in Saudi Arabia', *Proceedings, Social Justice and Poverty in Muslim World*, 2015, 1–9.

¹³ Omayya Chidiac, 'Migrant Construction and Domestic Workers in the Arab Gulf States: Modern - Day Slaves?' (York University Toronto, 2014) <<https://digitalcommons.osgoode.yorku.ca/llm/16>>.

¹⁴ Ibid

¹⁵ Mohammed Dito, 'Kafala: Foundations of Migrant Exclusion in GCC Labor Markets', *Transit States: Labor, Migration & Citizenship in the Gulf*, 2015, 79–100 (p. 23).

of labor law in Islamic law with civil law can create harmonization in its implementation through:

1. Regulatory alignment

The government can adopt labor law principles in Islamic Law in national laws and regulations, thereby creating harmony between national law and religious law.¹⁶The Indonesian government has adopted labor law principles in Islamic law through various national laws and regulations. This is done to create harmony between national law and religious law and provide protection for the rights of workers in Indonesia.

Some examples of national laws and regulations that adopt the principles of labor law in Islamic law include:

- a. Act Number 13 of 2003 concerning Employment: This Law contains various provisions concerning the rights and obligations of workers and employers. This law also emphasizes the importance of protecting workers through occupational safety and health as well as social security for workers.
- b. Act Number 2 of 2004 concerning Settlement of Industrial Relations Disputes: This law provides a legal basis for settling disputes between workers and employers through non-litigation channels. Islamic Law principles such as deliberation and mediation are promoted as better ways of resolving disputes.
- c. Act Number 11 of 2020 concerning Job Creation: This law emphasizes the importance of providing competency training and certification for workers to improve the workforce quality in Indonesia. This law also emphasizes the importance of protecting occupational health and safety workers.

2. Fair law enforcement

The government must ensure that labor law enforcement is carried out fairly and consistently, in accordance with the principles of Islamic Law and the Civil Code of Citizenship. Fair and consistent enforcement of labor laws is essential to ensure that the rights of workers and employers are respected and protected. This is also part of efforts to create a stable business environment and ensure social justice for all of society.

In the context of Islamic Law, fair and consistent enforcement of labor law must pay attention to the principles of social justice and partiality to the weak. Islamic law also emphasizes the importance of protecting workers' rights, such as the right to a fair wage and guaranteed welfare.

¹⁶ Nicholas HD Foster, 'The Islamic Law of Guarantees', *Arab Law Quarterly*, 16.2 (2001), 133 (p. 133) <<https://heinonline.org/HOL/Page?handle=hein.journals/arablq16&id=149&div=&collection=>>>.

Meanwhile, in the Civil Code of Citizenship, fair and consistent enforcement of labor laws must pay attention to the provisions of the applicable laws and regulations. This includes protection of the rights of workers and employers regulated in the Manpower Act, such as the right to wages, social security, and the right to obtain legal protection.

3. Cooperation between religious institutions and the government

Religious institutions and the government can work together in supervising and ensuring the implementation of labor law principles in Islamic Law and Civil Law on Citizenship. This cooperation can be done through coordination, training, and dissemination of information to the public. One form of cooperation that can be carried out between religious institutions and the government is through coordination in the delivery of information related to applicable labor laws. Religious institutions can act as facilitators in conveying information about the principles of Islamic law related to employment. At the same time, the government can provide information about the provisions of the applicable Citizenship Civil Code.

In addition, cooperation can be carried out through training and education related to labor law. Religious institutions can provide training regarding the principles of the Islamic law that apply in the world of work to the public, including workers and employers. The government can also provide training regarding the provisions of civil law on citizenship and effective and fair ways of enforcing labor law.

4. Settlement of labor disputes

In resolving labor disputes, employers and workers can refer to the principles of Islamic and civil law on citizenship. This will help create a fair and balanced solution for both parties.¹⁷In Islamic Law, the principles of justice and deliberation are very important in resolving disputes, including labor disputes. Disputing parties are expected to communicate well and reach an agreement through deliberation. Apart from that, Islamic law also recognizes the principle of compensation or compensation that must be given to the aggrieved party.

Meanwhile, in Civil Citizenship Law, the principles of justice and equality are also very important in resolving labor disputes. The aggrieved party may file a legal suit or claim through a court or an authorized labor dispute resolution institution. Apart from that, in the Citizenship Civil Law, it is also recognized that there is a right to compensation or compensation for losses suffered.

Resolving labor disputes is often challenging and requires a complex process. However, by referring to Islamic and civil law principles, both parties can find a fair and balanced solution. Parties can seek the assistance of a dispute resolution

¹⁷ Yasin Kakande, *Slave States: The Practice of Kafala in the Gulf Arab Region* (UK: John Hunt Publishing, 2015).

institution or mediator who can help resolve disputes in a mutually beneficial way and avoids actions that are detrimental to either party.

5. Education and training

Education and training related to labor law in Islamic Law and Citizenship Civil Law must be provided to employers, workers, and the wider community. This will help increase understanding of the rights and obligations of each party, as well as encourage compliance with applicable laws. Employers need to be provided with education and training regarding their rights and obligations as entrepreneurs and statutory provisions that must be complied with. This includes labor protection, wages, social security, and work safety rules. With a good understanding of labor law, employers can ensure that the work environment in their place is safe and comfortable for workers.

Workers also need to be provided with education and training regarding their rights as workers, such as the right to a living wage, social security, and protection from discrimination. Apart from that, they also need to be given information about their obligations as workers, such as the obligation to comply with work safety rules and maintain a good working relationship with their employer. With a good understanding of their rights and obligations, workers can take appropriate steps if their rights are violated.

By integrating labor law principles in Islamic Law with the Civil Code of Citizenship, it is expected to create harmonization in its implementation. This will help ensure the protection of workers' rights, fairness in the relationship between employers and workers, and promote sustainable and inclusive economic growth.

Challenges and Obstacles Faced in Implementing the Integration of Employment Law in Islamic Law and Civil Law of Citizenship in Contemporary Societies

Implementing the integration of labor law in Islamic law and civil law of citizenship in contemporary society faces various challenges and obstacles. The following are some of the challenges and obstacles faced:

1. Differences in the philosophical basis

Islamic law and civil law on citizenship have different philosophical foundations. Islamic law is based on religious teachings and legal sources from the Al-Quran and Hadith.¹⁸ Meanwhile, civil law on citizenship is based on a positive legal system implemented by the state.¹⁹ The obstacles in creating integration between Islamic law and civil law on citizenship are quite complex,

¹⁸ Shad Saleem Faruqi, 'Documenting Reconciliation: The Malaysian Experience in Defusing Ethnic and Religious Tensions', *Journal of Law and Religion*, 31.1 (2016), 289 (p. 383).

¹⁹ Martha Nussbaum, 'Education for Citizenship in an Era of Global Connection', *Studies in Philosophy and Education*, 21.4 (2002), 289–303 (p. 289) <<https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1019837105053>>.

given the different philosophical foundations. This difference in basis can become an obstacle to creating integration between the two legal systems.

2. The difference between principles and norms

Islamic law and civil law of citizenship have different principles and norms. In Islamic law, for example, cooperation and social justice are emphasized.²⁰ On the other hand, civil law on citizenship places more emphasis on protecting individual rights and personal interests.²¹ Unifying these different principles and norms is a challenge in integrating the two legal systems.

3. Differences in legal systems

Islamic law is part of the religious legal system in various countries with a majority Muslim population.²² Meanwhile, civil law on citizenship is part of the national legal system applied in each country.²³ Integrating these two legal systems is a challenge in integrating labor law in Islamic law and civil law in citizenship.

4. Resistance from society

Integrating Islamic law and citizenship civil law can cause resistance from society.²⁴ Some parties may feel that such integration threatens the values believed and adhered to by each legal system and can lead to social conflict.

5. Limited resources and expertise

Combining labor law into Islamic law and civil law on citizenship requires adequate resources and expertise.²⁵ This is a challenge because not all countries have sufficient resources and expertise to integrate the two legal systems.

²⁰ Mehran Kamrava and Zahra Babar, 'Situating Labor Migration in the Persian Gulf', *Migrant Labor in the Persian Gulf*, 2012, 1–20 (p. 20).

²¹ Radhika Kanchana, *Is the Kafala Tradition to Blame for the Exploitative Work Conditions in the Arab-Gulf Countries*, In *South Asian Migration in the Gulf: Causes and Consequences* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2018), p. 347 <https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-71821-7_4> [accessed April 20, 2023].

²² Noora Lori, 'Temporary Workers or Permanent Migrants? The Kafala System and Contestations over Residency in the Arab Gulf States, 2012, p. 48 <<https://policycommons.net/artifacts/1407023/temporary-workers-or-permanent-migrants-the-kafala-system-and-contestations-over-residency-in-the-arab-gulf-states/2021286/>> [accessed April 20, 2023].

²³ Malaeb Hanan, 'The "Kafala" System and Human Rights: Time for a Decision', *Arab Law Quarterly*, 29.4 (2015), 307–42 (p. 337) <<https://doi.org/10.1163/15730255-12341307>>.

²⁴ Neha Vora, *Impossible Citizens: Dubai's Indian Diaspora* (London: Duke University Press, 2013), p. 104.

²⁵ *Ibid*

To address these challenges and obstacles, the following solutions and contributions could be considered:

1. Education and awareness-raising: It is important to educate stakeholders on the principles and implications of integrating employment law in Islamic law and civil law of citizenship, to increase their understanding and support for the initiative.
2. Engagement with local communities: Engaging with local communities and taking into account cultural and social norms can help to ensure that the integration of employment law in Islamic law and civil law of citizenship is implemented in a way that is culturally sensitive and acceptable to local populations.
3. Capacity building: Capacity building for legal professionals and practitioners can help to ensure that they have the necessary skills and knowledge to interpret and implement the integration of employment law in Islamic law and civil law of citizenship.
4. Stakeholder consultations: Consultations with stakeholders, including employers, employees, and legal professionals, can help to identify and address any concerns or resistance to the integration of employment law in Islamic law and civil law of citizenship.

In Indonesia, these solutions and contributions can be implemented through various measures, including legal education and training programs for legal professionals, awareness-raising campaigns for employers and employees, and stakeholder consultations with local communities. Additionally, the government can play a role in promoting and facilitating the integration of employment law in Islamic law and civil law of citizenship through policy initiatives and legal reforms that promote harmonization of legal principles and systems.

To overcome the above challenges and obstacles, several steps can be taken, including involving Islamic law experts and civil law in the integration process, drafting laws that accommodate the principles and norms of the two legal systems, and promoting dialogue and discussion between the stakeholders involved.²⁶

In addition, efforts to educate and socialize the community need to be carried out to build understanding and support for integrating labor law into Islamic law and civil law on citizenship. Inclusive and interdisciplinary legal education is also important to produce experts who can face the challenges of integrating these two legal systems.

In a global context, cooperation between countries and international organizations is also needed to exchange experiences and best practices in integrating labor law into Islamic law and civil law. This will assist countries in overcoming the challenges and obstacles encountered in this integration process.

²⁶ Mohamed Azam Mohamed Adil and Nisar Mohammad Ahmad, 'Islamic Law and Human Rights in Malaysia', *Islam and Civilizational Renewal*, 5.1 (2014), p. 43 <<https://doi.org/10.12816/0009803>>.

The integration of labor law into Islamic law and civil law on citizenship is a complex and challenging endeavor. However, through the right and collaborative approach, this integration can be realized by overcoming the various challenges and obstacles encountered.

First, dialogue and discussion between experts in Islamic law and civil law on citizenship must be a priority. By mutually understanding and respecting the differences in principles, norms and existing legal systems, both parties can seek solutions that accommodate the interests of both legal systems.

Second, inclusive and interdisciplinary legal education will help produce experts who are able to face the challenges of integrating these two legal systems. Education should include an understanding of Islamic law, the civil law of citizenship, and how the two legal systems can be integrated into the context of labor law.

Third, education and socialization efforts for the public are very important to build understanding and support for integrating employment law into Islamic law and civil law on citizenship. Legal education and an effective communication program will help communities understand the benefits and goals of this integration.

Fourth, cooperation between countries and international organizations is needed. The exchange of experiences and best practices in integrating labor law into Islamic law and civil law on citizenship will assist countries in overcoming the challenges and obstacles encountered in this integration process.

With a comprehensive and collaborative approach, integration between labor law in Islamic law and civil law of citizenship can be achieved. This will help create a more inclusive and fair legal system, strengthen the protection of workers' rights and promote social justice in society.

CONCLUSION

Several strategic steps need to be taken to integrate labor law principles in Islamic law with civil law on citizenship. First, open dialogue and discussion between Islamic law experts and civil law on citizenship. This dialogue is essential for finding common ground and understanding the differences in principles, norms and existing legal systems, and second, drafting laws and regulations that accommodate the codes and standards of both legal systems. This will harmonize its implementation, resulting in a more inclusive and just legal system. Third, involving inclusive and interdisciplinary legal education. This education will produce experts able to face the challenges of integrating the two legal systems and help create effective solutions. They were fourth, educating the public about the benefits and objectives of integration between labor law in Islamic law and civil law on citizenship. This outreach is essential to build community understanding and support for such integration. Fifth, increase cooperation between countries and international organizations. This collaboration will enable the mutual exchange of experiences and best practices in integrating labor law into Islamic law and civil law for citizenship, thereby helping countries overcome the challenges and obstacles they face. Several things need to be watched out for in facing challenges and obstacles. For example, the differences in philosophical foundations, principles and norms between Islamic law and civil law for citizenship, as well as in the existing legal systems.

Besides that, resistance from people who feel that integration threatens the values they believe in and adhere to can potentially cause social conflict. Finally, there are limited resources and sufficient expertise to integrate the two legal systems. However, with a comprehensive and collaborative approach, integration between labor law in Islamic law and civil law can be achieved. This will create a more inclusive and fair legal system, strengthen the protection of workers' rights, and promote social justice in society with a comprehensive and collaborative approach; integration between labor law in Islamic law and civil law can be achieved. This will create a more inclusive and fair legal system, strengthen the protection of workers' rights, and promote social justice in society with a comprehensive and collaborative approach; integration between labor law in Islamic law and civil law can be achieved. This will create a more inclusive and fair legal system, strengthen the protection of workers' rights, and promote social justice in society.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adil, Mohamed Azam Mohamed, and Nisar Mohammad Ahmad, 'Islamic Law and Human Rights in Malaysia', *Islam and Civilisational Renewal*, 5.1 (2014) <<https://doi.org/10.12816/0009803>>
- Alexander, Christopher, 'Opportunities, Organizations, And Ideas: Islamists And Workers In Tunisia And Algeria', *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 32.4 (2000), 465–90 <<https://doi.org/10.1017/S0020743800021176>>
- Asadov, Ayaz, 'Fatwa Making in the Context of Abnormal Justice: The Case of Migrant Workers in Saudi Arabia', *Proceedings, Social Justice and Poverty in Muslim World*, 2015, 1–9
- Berger, M, 'Comparative Law and the Legal System of Employment Relations', *International Journal of Comparative Labour Law and Industrial Relations*, 32.1 (2016), 13
- Chidiac, Omayya, 'Migrant Construction and Domestic Workers in the Arab Gulf States: Modern - Day Slaves?' (York University Toronto, 2014) <<https://digitalcommons.osgoode.yorku.ca/llm/16>>
- David, René, and John E. C. Brierley, *Major Legal Systems in the World Today: An Introduction to the Comparative Study of Law* (Simon and Schuster, 1978)
- Davidov, Guy, and Brian Langille, *The Idea of Labour Law* (USA: Oxford University Press, 2011)
- Dito, Mohammed, 'Kafala: Foundations of Migrant Exclusion in GCC Labour Markets', *Transit States: Labour, Migration & Citizenship in the Gulf*, 2015, 79–100
- Easterly, William, 'The Political Economy of Growth Without Development: A Case Study of Pakistan', *Search of Prosperity, Analytic Narratives on Economic Growth Princeton*, 2003

- Faruqi, Shad Saleem, 'Documenting Reconciliation: The Malaysian Experience in Defusing Ethnic and Religious Tensions', *Journal of Law and Religion*, 31.1 (2016), 289
- Foster, Nicholas H. D., 'The Islamic Law of Guarantees', *Arab Law Quarterly*, 16.2 (2001), 133
<<https://heinonline.org/HOL/Page?handle=hein.journals/arablq16&id=149&div=&collection=>>
- Hanan, Malaeb, 'The "Kafala" System and Human Rights: Time for a Decision', *Arab Law Quarterly*, 29.4 (2015), 307–42 <<https://doi.org/10.1163/15730255-12341307>>
- Hasan, S, 'Islamic Law and the Workplace: A Study of Labor Rights in Islamic Jurisprudence', *Journal of Islamic Law Review*, 11.2 (2015), 157
- Kakande, Yasin, *Slave States: The Practice of Kafala in the Gulf Arab Region* (UK: John Hunt Publishing, 2015)
- Kamrava, Mehran, and Zahra Babar, 'Situating Labor Migration in the Persian Gulf', *Migrant Labor in the Persian Gulf*, 2012, 1–20
- Kanchana, Radhika, *Is the Kafala Tradition to Blame for the Exploitative Work Conditions in the Arab-Gulf Countries*, In *South Asian Migration in the Gulf: Causes and Consequences* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2018) <https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-71821-7_4> [accessed April 20, 2023]
- Koltay, András, *Comparative Perspectives on the Fundamental Freedom of Expression* (Wolters Kluwer Ltd., 2015)
- Lori, Noora, 'Temporary Workers or Permanent Migrants? The Kafala System and Contestations over Residency in the Arab Gulf States', 2012 <<https://policycommons.net/artifacts/1407023/temporary-workers-or-permanent-migrants-the-kafala-system-and-contestations-over-residency-in-the-arab-gulf-states/2021286/>> [accessed April 20, 2023]
- Marzuki, Peter Mahmud, *Pengantar Ilmu Hukum Edisi Revisi* (Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2008)
- Nussbaum, Martha, 'Education for Citizenship in an Era of Global Connection', *Studies in Philosophy and Education*, 21.4 (2002), 289–303 <<https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1019837105053>>
- Shah, Prakash, *Legal Pluralism in Conflict: Coping with Cultural Diversity in Law* (United States: Psychology Press, 2005)
- Siddiqi, M.N., 'Employment Relations in Islam: A Normative View', *The Islamic Quarterly*, 57.1 (2013), 36
- Soerjono Soekanto dan Sri Mamudji, 'Penelitian Hukum Normatif Suatu Tinjauan Umum', in *Rajawali Pers, Jakarta*, 2007

Vora, Neha, *Impossible Citizens: Dubai's Indian Diaspora* (London: Duke University Press, 2013)